Microstructure of charge order in the cuprates, and implications for the pseudogap

Strong Correlations and Unconventional Superconductivity: Towards a Conceptual Framework KITP, Santa Barbara

> September 23, 2014 Subir Sachdev



Talk online: sachdev.physics.harvard.edu



PHYSICS







Michael Lawler

Cornell



Mohammad Hamidian Cornell / BNL



J. C. Seamus Davis



Stephen Edkins Cornell / St Andrews



Eun-Ah Kim

Cornell







See talk by Kazuhiro Fujita on Friday



Stephen Edkins Cornell / St Andrews



Michael Lawler



J. C. Seamus Davis



Eun-Ah Kim

Theorists at Harvard





Rolando La Placa

(MIT)



Andrea Allais

Max Metlitski (KITP, UCSB)







Alexandra Thomson



Johannes Bauer

Debanjan Chowdhury

Theorists at Harvard



Max Metlitski (KITP, UCSB)



Johannes Bauer

Debanjan Chowdhury

Jay Deep Sau (Maryland)



Alexandra Thomson



Reposter by Debanjan Chowdhury ea Allais







T. Wu, H. Mayaffre, S. Kramer, M. Horvatic, C. Berthier, W.N. Hardy, R. Liang, D.A. Bonn, and M.-H. Julien, Nature **477**, 191 (2011).



T. Wu, H. Mayaffre, S. Kramer, M. Horvatic, C. Berthier, W.N. Hardy, R. Liang, D.A. Bonn, and M.-H. Julien, Nature **477**, 191 (2011).



Start with an antiferromagnet



Domain walls 4 lattice spacings apart



Put the holes in the domain walls

Observed in La-based compounds (Tranquada..)



Put the holes in the domain walls



Colors on the bonds map the local exchange energy



T. Wu, H. Mayaffre, S. Kramer, M. Horvatic, C. Berthier, W.N. Hardy, R. Liang, D.A. Bonn, and M.-H. Julien, Nature **477**, 191 (2011).

See also

C. Howald, H. Eisaki, N. Kaneko, M. Greven, and A. Kapitulnik, Phys. Rev. B **67**, 014533 (2003);

M. Vershinin, S. Misra, S. Ono, Y. Abe, Yoichi Ando, and A. Yazdani, Science **303**, 1995 (2004).

W. D. Wise, M. C. Boyer,
K. Chatterjee, T. Kondo,
T. Takeuchi, H. Ikuta,
Y. Wang, and
E. W. Hudson,
Nature Phys. 4, 696
(2008).



"R-map" of BSCCO in zero magnetic field, similar to those published in Y. Kohsaka, C. Taylor, K. Fujita, A. Schmidt, C. Lupien, T. Hanaguri, M. Azuma, M. Takano, H. Eisaki, H. Takagi, S. Uchida, and J. C. Davis, *Science* **315**, 1380 (2007). Davis group has sub-angstrom resolution capabilities, with lattice drift corrections, which make sublattice phase-resolved STM possible.

See also

C. Howald, H. Eisaki, N. Kaneko, M. Greven, and A. Kapitulnik, Phys. Rev. B **67**, 014533 (2003);

M. Vershinin, S. Misra, S. Ono, Y. Abe, Yoichi Ando, and A. Yazdani, Science **303**, 1995 (2004).

W. D. Wise, M. C. Boyer,
K. Chatterjee, T. Kondo,
T. Takeuchi, H. Ikuta,
Y. Wang, and
E. W. Hudson,
Nature Phys. 4, 696
(2008).



"R-map" of BSCCO in zero magnetic field, similar to those published in Y. Kohsaka, C. Taylor, K. Fujita, A. Schmidt, C. Lupien, T. Hanaguri, M. Azuma, M. Takano, H. Eisaki, H. Takagi, S. Uchida, and J. C. Davis, *Science* **315**, 1380 (2007). Davis group has sub-angstrom resolution capabilities, with lattice drift corrections, which make sublattice phase-resolved STM possible.



Y. Kohsaka et al., Science **315**, 1380 (2007)



Y. Kohsaka et al., SCIENCE **315**, 1380 (2007)





Y. Kohsaka et al., SCIENCE **315**, 1380 (2007)



 $\boldsymbol{\chi}$

Microstructure of STM picture does not match this simple "stripe" model

Charge density wave (CDW) order



<u>Unconventional</u> density wave (DW) : Bose condensation of particle-hole pairs



M.A. Metlitski and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev. B* 85, 075127 (2010)

<u>Unconventional</u> density wave (DW) : Bose condensation of particle-hole pairs

$$\left\langle c_{\alpha}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{r}_{1})c_{\alpha}(\mathbf{r}_{2})\right\rangle$$

$$= \left[\mathcal{P}(\mathbf{r}_{1}-\mathbf{r}_{2})\right] \times \Psi_{DW}\left(\frac{\mathbf{r}_{1}+\mathbf{r}_{2}}{2}\right)e^{i\mathbf{Q}\cdot(\mathbf{r}_{1}+\mathbf{r}_{2})/2} + \text{c.c.}$$

$$\left(\begin{array}{c} \text{Crucial "center-of-mass" co-ordinate.} \\ \text{(Not used in previous work)} \\ \text{Simplifies action of time-reversal} \end{array}\right)$$

M.A. Metlitski and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 85, 075127 (2010)

<u>Unconventional</u> density wave (DW) : Bose condensation of particle-hole pairs

$$\begin{split} \left\langle c_{\alpha}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{r}_{1})c_{\alpha}(\mathbf{r}_{2})\right\rangle \\ &= \left[\mathcal{P}(\mathbf{r}_{1}-\mathbf{r}_{2})\right] \times \Psi_{DW}\left(\frac{\mathbf{r}_{1}+\mathbf{r}_{2}}{2}\right)e^{i\mathbf{Q}\cdot(\mathbf{r}_{1}+\mathbf{r}_{2})/2} + \text{c.c.} \\ \end{split} \\ \text{Density wave form factor (internal particle-hole pair wavefunction)} \\ \mathcal{P}(\mathbf{r}) &= \int \frac{d^{2}k}{4\pi^{2}}\mathcal{P}(\mathbf{k})e^{i\mathbf{k}\cdot\mathbf{r}} \\ \text{Time-reversal symmetry requires } \mathcal{P}(\mathbf{k}) &= \mathcal{P}(-\mathbf{k}). \\ \text{We expand (using reflection symmetry for } \mathbf{Q} \text{ along axes or diagonals}) \\ \mathcal{P}(\mathbf{k}) &= \mathcal{P}_{s} + \mathcal{P}_{s'}(\cos k_{x} + \cos k_{y}) + \mathcal{P}_{d}(\cos k_{x} - \cos k_{y}) \end{split}$$

M.A. Metlitski and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 85, 075127 (2010)







M. H. Fischer, Si Wu, M. Lawler, A. Paramekanti, and Eun-Ah Kim, arXiv:1406.2711



Orbital symmetry of charge density wave order in $La_{1.88}Ba_{0.12}CuO_4$ and $YBa_2Cu_3O_{6.67}$

A. J. Achkar,¹ F. He,² R. Sutarto,² Christopher McMahon,¹ M. Zwiebler,³ M. Hücker,⁴ G. Gu,⁴ Ruixing Liang,⁵ D. A. Bonn,⁵ W. N. Hardy,⁵ J. Geck,³ and D. G. Hawthorn¹

M. H. Fischer, Si Wu, M. Lawler, A. Paramekanti, and Eun-Ah Kim, arXiv:1406.2711



Y. Kohsaka et al., SCIENCE **315**, 1380 (2007)

s + s'-form factor density wave

 $\cdot \chi$

s + s' form factor does not match STM measurements on BSCCO, Na-CCOC.



M. A. Metlitski and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 82, 075128 (2010). S. Sachdev and R. LaPlaca, Phys. Rev. Lett. 111, 027202 (2013).



M. A. Metlitski and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 82, 075128 (2010). S. Sachdev and R. LaPlaca, Phys. Rev. Lett. 111, 027202 (2013).



Y. Kohsaka et al., SCIENCE **315**, 1380 (2007)

d-form factor density wave order

d form factor is compatible with STM measurements on BSCCO, Na-CCOC !

Direct phase-sensitive identification of a *d*-form factor density wave in underdoped cuprates

Kazuhiro Fujita^{a,b,c,1}, Mohammad H. Hamidian^{a,b,1}, Stephen D. Edkins^{b,d}, Chung Koo Kim^a, Yuhki Kohsaka^e, Masaki Azuma^f, Mikio Takano^g, Hidenori Takagi^{c,h,i}, Hiroshi Eisaki^j, Shin-ichi Uchida^c, Andrea Allais^k, Michael J. Lawler^{b,l}, Eun-Ah Kim^b, Subir Sachdev^{k,m}, and J. C. Séamus Davis^{a,b,d,2}

Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 111, E3026 (2014)



Kazuhiro Fujita Cornell/ BNL See talk by Kazuhiro Fujita on Friday:

I. Measurement of π phase shift between horizontal and vertical bonds and predominant *d*-form factor

2. Intimate connection of *d*-form factor to pseudogap

Outline

I. Density waves in the underdoped cuprates STM observation of d-form factor density wave

2. RPA theory of density waves

3. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) on the Kondo lattice

4. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) in doped square lattice antiferromagnets d-form factor density waves with the correct wavevector

Outline

I. Density waves in the underdoped cuprates STM observation of d-form factor density wave

2. RPA theory of density waves

3. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) on the Kondo lattice

4. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) in doped square lattice antiferromagnets d-form factor density waves with the correct wavevector

Outline

I. Density waves in the underdoped cuprates STM observation of d-form factor density wave

2. RPA theory of density waves

3. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) on the Kondo lattice

4. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) in doped square lattice antiferromagnets d-form factor density waves with the correct wavevector

Fermi surface+antiferromagnetism


Pairing "glue" from antiferromagnetic fluctuations



V. J. Emery, J. Phys. (Paris) Colloq. 44, C3-977 (1983) D.J. Scalapino, E. Loh, and J.E. Hirsch, Phys. Rev. B 34, 8190 (1986) K. Miyake, S. Schmitt-Rink, and C. M. Varma, Phys. Rev. B 34, 6554 (1986)

Pairing "glue" from antiferromagnetic fluctuations



V. J. Emery, J. Phys. (Paris) Colloq. 44, C3-977 (1983) D.J. Scalapino, E. Loh, and J.E. Hirsch, Phys. Rev. B 34, 8190 (1986) K. Miyake, S. Schmitt-Rink, and C. M.Varma, Phys. Rev. B 34, 6554 (1986)

 $\left\langle c_{\mathbf{k}\alpha}^{\dagger}c_{-\mathbf{k}\beta}^{\dagger}\right\rangle = \varepsilon_{\alpha\beta}\Delta(\cos k_x - \cos k_y)$



Unconventional pairing at <u>and near</u> hot spots

Pseudospin symmetry of the exchange interaction

$$H_J = \sum_{i < j} J_{ij} \, \vec{S}_i \cdot \vec{S}_j$$

with $\vec{S}_i = \frac{1}{2} c_{i\alpha}^{\dagger} \vec{\sigma}_{\alpha\beta} c_{i\beta}$ is the antiferromagnetic exchange interaction. Introduce the Nambu spinor

$$\Psi_{i\uparrow} = \begin{pmatrix} c_{i\uparrow} \\ c_{i\downarrow}^{\dagger} \end{pmatrix} , \quad \Psi_{i\downarrow} = \begin{pmatrix} c_{i\downarrow} \\ -c_{i\uparrow}^{\dagger} \end{pmatrix}$$

Then we can write

$$H_J = \frac{1}{8} \sum_{i < j} J_{ij} \left(\Psi_{i\alpha a}^{\dagger} \vec{\sigma}_{\alpha\beta} \Psi_{i\beta a} \right) \cdot \left(\Psi_{j\gamma b}^{\dagger} \vec{\sigma}_{\gamma\delta} \Psi_{j\delta b} \right)$$

where a, b are the Nambu indices. This form makes explicit the symmetry under *independent* SU(2) pseudospin transformations on each site

$$\Psi_{i\alpha a} \to U_{i,ab} \Psi_{i\alpha b}$$

I. Affleck, Z. Zou, T. Hsu, and P. W. Anderson, Phys. Rev. B 38, 745 (1988)
E. Dagotto, E. Fradkin, and A. Moreo, Phys. Rev. B 38, 2926 (1988)
P. A. Lee, N. Nagaosa, and X.-G. Wen, Rev. Mod. Phys. 78, 17 (2006)

Pairing "glue" from antiferromagnetic fluctuations



Perform pseudospin rotation on B and D electrons, but not on A and C electrons: <u>Same</u> "glue" leads to particle-hole pairing



M.A. Metlitski and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 85, 075127 (2010)

 $\left\langle c_{\mathbf{k}\alpha}^{\dagger}c_{-\mathbf{k}\beta}^{\dagger}\right\rangle = \varepsilon_{\alpha\beta}\Delta(\cos k_x - \cos k_y)$



Unconventional pairing at <u>and near</u> hot spots

 $\left\langle c_{\mathbf{k}-\mathbf{Q}/2,\alpha}^{\dagger}c_{\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{Q}/2,\alpha}\right\rangle = \mathcal{P}_{d}(\cos k_{x} - \cos k_{y})$

"d-form factor" density wave

After pseudospin rotation on *half* the hot-spots

M.A. Metlitski and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev. B* **85**, 075127 (2010)

$$\left\langle c_{\mathbf{k}-\mathbf{Q}/2,\alpha}^{\dagger}c_{\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{Q}/2,\alpha}\right\rangle = \mathcal{P}_d(\cos k_x - \cos k_y)$$

After pseudospin rotation on *half* the hot-spots

M.A. Metlitski and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev. B* **85**, 075127 (2010)



<u>d-form factor density wave</u>



<u>d-form factor density wave</u>



S. Sachdev and R. La Placa, Phys. Rev. Lett. 111, 027202 (2013); A.Allais, J. Bauer, and S. Sachdev, arXiv: 1402.6311



S. Sachdev and R. La Placa, Phys. Rev. Lett. 111, 027202 (2013); A. Allais, J. Bauer, and S. Sachdev, arXiv: 1402.6311



S. Sachdev and R. La Placa, Phys. Rev. Lett. 111, 027202 (2013); A. Allais, J. Bauer, and S. Sachdev, arXiv: 1402.6311



with a large Fermi surface





Outline

I. Density waves in the underdoped cuprates STM observation of d-form factor density wave

2. RPA theory of density waves

3. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) on the Kondo lattice

4. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) in doped square lattice antiferromagnets d-form factor density waves with the correct wavevector

Outline

I. Density waves in the underdoped cuprates STM observation of d-form factor density wave

2. RPA theory of density waves

3. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) on the Kondo lattice

4. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) in doped square lattice antiferromagnets d-form factor density waves with the correct wavevector

<u>Magnetic order and the</u> <u>heavy Fermi liquid in the Kondo lattice</u>



 $\left\langle \vec{\varphi} \right\rangle \neq 0$

Magnetic Metal: f-electron moments and c-conduction electron Fermi surface



 $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle = 0$ Heavy Fermi liquid with "large" Fermi surface of hydridized f and c-conduction electrons



 $\left<\vec{\varphi}\right>\neq 0$

Magnetic Metal: f-electron moments and c-conduction electron Fermi surface f+c

 $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle = 0$ Heavy Fermi liquid with "large" Fermi surface of hydridized f and c-conduction electrons



 $\left<\vec{\varphi}\right>\neq 0$

Magnetic Metal: f-electron moments and c-conduction electron Fermi surface





 $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle = 0$ Heavy Fermi liquid with "large" Fermi surface of hydridized f and c-conduction electrons



 $\left<\vec{\varphi}\right>\neq 0$

Magnetic Metal: f-electron moments and c-conduction electron Fermi surface



Fractionalized Fermi liquid (FL*) phase with no symmetry breaking and "small" Fermi surface



 $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle = 0$ Heavy Fermi liquid with "large" Fermi surface of hydridized f and c-conduction electrons

T. Senthil, S. Sachdev, and M. Vojta, Phys. Rev. Lett. 90, 216403 (2003)



 $\left<\vec{\varphi}\right>\neq 0$

Magnetic Metal: f-electron moments and c-conduction electron Fermi surface



T. Senthil, S. Sachdev, and M. Vojta, Phys. Rev. Lett. 90, 216403 (2003)

Characteristics of FL* phase

- Fermi surface volume does not count all electrons.
- Such a phase *must* have low energy collective gauge excitations ("topological" order).
- These low energy gauge excitations are needed to account for the deficit in the Fermi surface volume, in M. Oshikawa's proof of the Luttinger theorem.

T. Senthil, M.Vojta, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 69, 035111 (2004)

Lieb-Schultz-Mattis-Laughlin-Bonesteel-Affleck-Yamanaka-Oshikawa flux-piercing arguments





Compute change in momentum due to inserting a single flux quantum. Equating this to the momentum acquired by the quasiparticles, we obtain the Luttinger theorem for the volume of the Fermi surface of a Fermi liquid.

M. Oshikawa, Phys. Rev. Lett. 84, 3370 (2000).

Effect of flux-piercing on a spin liquid



N. E. Bonesteel, *Phys. Rev.* B 40, 8954 (1989).
G. Misguich, C. Lhuillier,
M. Mambrini, and P. Sindzingre, *Eur. Phys. J.* B 26, 167 (2002).

$$\left|\Psi\right\rangle = \sum_{D} a_{D} \left|D\right\rangle$$

Effect of flux-piercing on a spin liquid



The vison contributes to the momentum count. A fractionalized Fermi liquid has *both* vison-like topological excitations and electron-like quasiparticles, and so the flux-piercing argument is compatible with a "small" Fermi surface.

T. Senthil, M. Vojta, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 69, 035111 (2004)

Outline

I. Density waves in the underdoped cuprates STM observation of d-form factor density wave

2. RPA theory of density waves

3. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) on the Kondo lattice

4. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) in doped square lattice antiferromagnets d-form factor density waves with the correct wavevector

Outline

I. Density waves in the underdoped cuprates STM observation of d-form factor density wave

2. RPA theory of density waves

3. Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) on the Kondo lattice

 Fractionalized Fermi liquids (FL*) in doped square lattice antiferromagnets d-form factor density waves with the correct wavevector

Quantum "disordering" magnetic order



Spin liquid with a "**photon**", which is unstable to the appearance of valence bond solid (VBS) order

collinear Néel state

 S_{c}

N. Read and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. Lett. 62, 1694 (1989).

S

Neel-VBS quantum transition



O.I. Motrunich and A. Vishwanath, *Phys. Rev. B* **70**, 075104 (2004). T. Senthil, A. Vishwanath, L. Balents, S. Sachdev and M.P.A. Fisher, *Science* **303**, 1490 (2004).



T. Senthil, A. Vishwanath, L. Balents, S. Sachdev and M.P.A. Fisher, Science 303, 1490 (2004).







D. Chowdhury and S. Sachdev, arXiv:1409.5430




D. Chowdhury and S. Sachdev, arXiv:1409.5430

Y. Qi and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 81, 115129 (2010)



The pseudogap is described by the U(1)-FL*: a state with hole pockets on a background of a spin-liquid described by a U(1) gauge theory. Its dominant density wave instability is a predominantly *d*-form factor density wave with a wavevector \mathbf{Q} along the (1,0) and (0,1) square lattice directions, in agreement with observations on the non-La-based cuprates.

D. Chowdhury and S. Sachdev, arXiv:1409.5430



Eigenvalues of spin-singlet, time-reversal-preserving particle-hole propagator

The pseudogap is described by the U(1)-FL*: a state with hole pockets on a background of a spin-liquid described by a U(1) gauge theory. Its dominant density wave instability is a predominantly *d*-form factor density wave with a wavevector \mathbf{Q} along the (1,0) and (0,1) square lattice directions, in agreement with observations on the non-La-based cuprates.

D. Chowdhury and S. Sachdev, arXiv:1409.5430

Conclusions

 d-form factor density wave order observed in the non-La hole-doped cuprate superconductors.

Conclusions

- I. d-form factor density wave order observed in the non-La hole-doped cuprate superconductors.
- 2. The "stripe" model corresponds to a s'-form factor, and this describes the La-based, lower T_c , hole-doped cuprate superconductors.

Conclusions

- I. d-form factor density wave order observed in the non-La hole-doped cuprate superconductors.
- 2. The "stripe" model corresponds to a s'-form factor, and this describes the La-based, lower T_c , hole-doped cuprate superconductors.
- 3. Is the *d*-form factor an unexpected window into the spin-liquid physics of the pseudogap ?



T. Wu, H. Mayaffre, S. Kramer, M. Horvatic, C. Berthier, W.N. Hardy, R. Liang, D.A. Bonn, and M.-H. Julien, Nature **477**, 191 (2011).



K. Fujita, M. H Hamidian, S. D. Edkins, Chung Koo Kim, Y. Kohsaka, M. Azuma, M. Takano, H. Takagi, H. Eisaki, S. Uchida, A. Allais, M. J. Lawler, E.-A. Kim, S. Sachdev, and J. C. Davis, PNAS **111**, E3026 (2014)